

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

\_\_\_\_\_  
In re POLYURETHANE FOAM ANTITRUST  
LITIGATION  
\_\_\_\_\_

This document relates to:

ALL CASES  
\_\_\_\_\_

)  
)  
)  
) MDL Docket No. 2196  
) Index No. 10-MD-2196 (JZ)  
)  
)  
)  
)

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION REQUESTING LEAVE TO FILE REPLY**  
**TO DIRECT PURCHASER AND INDIRECT PURCHASER CLASS PLAINTIFFS'**  
**OPPOSITION TO MOTIONS FOR RECONSIDERATION**  
**REGARDING FRAUDULENT CONCEALMENT**

Defendants respectfully request permission to file the attached reply to Direct Purchaser and Indirect Purchaser Class Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Arguments Regarding Fraudulent Concealment in Their Motions for Reconsideration (Doc. # 227) to correct mischaracterizations in Plaintiffs' Opposition as to the scope of Defendants' fraudulent concealment arguments and bring to the Court's attention to the recently decided case *In re Refrigerant Compressors Antitrust Litigation*, 2011 WL 2433392 (E.D. Mich. June 13, 2011), which contains a detailed discussion of the Sixth Circuit standards for assessing fraudulent concealment allegations and the application of that precedent to conspiratorial allegations similar to those made by Plaintiffs here.

Dated: August 17, 2011

/s/ James H. Walsh

James H. Walsh  
Howard Feller  
Bethany Lukitsch  
MCGUIREWOODS LLP  
One James Center  
901 East Cary Street  
Richmond, VA 23219-4030  
Phone: (804) 775-4356  
Fax: (804) 698-2200  
[jwalsh@mcguirewoods.com](mailto:jwalsh@mcguirewoods.com)  
[hfeller@mcguirewoods.com](mailto:hfeller@mcguirewoods.com)  
[blukitsch@mcguirewoods.com](mailto:blukitsch@mcguirewoods.com)

*Counsel for Carpenter Co., E.R.  
Carpenter, L.P., Carpenter Holdings, Inc.  
and Carpenter Canada Co.*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Kendall Millard

Kendall Millard  
BARNES & THORNBURG, LLP  
11 South Meridian Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46204-3535  
Phone: (317) 231-7461  
Fax: (317) 231-7433  
[kmillard@btlaw.com](mailto:kmillard@btlaw.com)

/s/ Michael D. Mustard

Michael D. Mustard  
BARNES & THORNBURG LLP  
600 One Summit Square  
Fort Wayne, IN 46802-3119  
Phone: (260) 423-9440  
Fax: (260) 424-8316  
[mmustard@btlaw.com](mailto:mmustard@btlaw.com)

*Counsel for Flexible Foam Products, Inc.,  
Ohio Decorative Products, Inc.*

/s/ Frank A. Hirsch, Jr.  
Frank A. Hirsch, Jr.  
Matthew P. McGuire  
ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
4721 Emperor Blvd.  
Suite 400  
Durham, NC 27703  
Phone: (919) 862-2200  
Fax: (919) 852-2260  
[frank.hirsch@alston.com](mailto:frank.hirsch@alston.com)  
[matt.mcguire@alston.com](mailto:matt.mcguire@alston.com)

Paul Michael Kaplan  
ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
90 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10016  
Phone: (212) 210-9400  
Fax: (212) 210-9444  
[paul.kaplan@alston.com](mailto:paul.kaplan@alston.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Hickory Springs  
Manufacturing Company*

/s/ Howard B. Iwrey  
Howard B. Iwrey  
Dykema Gossett, PLLC  
39577 Woodward Ave., Suite 300  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304-2820  
Phone: (248) 203-0526  
Fax: (248) 203-0763

*Counsel for Defendants Inoac USA Inc.  
and Crest Foam Industries, Inc.*

/s/ Daniel G. Swanson  
Daniel G. Swanson  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Phone: (213) 229-6690  
Fax: (213) 229-6919  
[dsawanson@gibsondunn.com](mailto:dsawanson@gibsondunn.com)

Cynthia Richman  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036-5306  
Phone: (202) 530-8500  
Fax: (202) 530-9651  
[crichman@gibsondunn.com](mailto:crichman@gibsondunn.com)

*Counsel for Woodbridge Foam  
Corporation, Woodbridge Sales &  
Engineering, Inc., and Woodbridge Foam  
Fabricating, Inc.*

/s/ Francis P. Newell  
Francis P. Newell  
Peter M. Ryan  
COZEN O'CONNOR  
1900 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Phone: (215) 665-2118  
Fax: (215) 665-2013  
[fnewell@cozen.com](mailto:fnewell@cozen.com)  
[pryan@cozen.com](mailto:pryan@cozen.com)

*Counsel for Defendant FXI - Foamex  
Innovations, Inc.*

/s/ Randall L. Allen

Randall L. Allen  
Teresa T. Bonder  
Erica F. Ghali  
ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
One Atlantic Center  
1201 W. Peachtree St.  
Atlanta, GA 30309  
Phone: (404) 881-7000  
Fax: (404) 881-7777  
[randall.allen@alston.com](mailto:randall.allen@alston.com)  
[teresea.bonder@alston.com](mailto:teresea.bonder@alston.com)  
[erica.ghali@alston.com](mailto:erica.ghali@alston.com)

*Counsel for Mohawk Industries, Inc.*

/s/ Edward G. Warin

Edward G. Warin  
John P. Passarelli  
KUTAK ROCK LLP  
1650 Farnam Street  
Omaha, NE 68102  
Phone: (402) 346-6000  
Fax: (402) 346-1148  
[edward.warin@kutakrock.com](mailto:edward.warin@kutakrock.com)  
[john.passarelli@kutakrock.com](mailto:john.passarelli@kutakrock.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Future Foam, Inc.*

/s/ Shepard Goldfein

Shepard Goldfein  
Elliot A. Silver  
Skadden, Arps, Slate,  
Meagher & Flom LLP  
Four Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
Phone: (212) 735-3000  
Fax: (212) 735-2000  
[shepard.goldfein@skadden.com](mailto:shepard.goldfein@skadden.com)  
[elliott.silver@skadden.com](mailto:elliott.silver@skadden.com)

*Counsel for Domfoam International, Inc.  
and Valle Foam Industries (1995) Inc.*

/s/ Sheldon Klein

Sheldon Klein  
BUTZEL LONG  
Stoneridge West  
4100 Woodward Ave.  
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304  
Phone: (248) 258-1414  
Fax: (248) 258-1439  
[klein@butzel.com](mailto:klein@butzel.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Plastomer  
Corporation*

/s/ Robert J. Gilmer, Jr.  
Robert J. Gilmer, Jr.  
EASTMAN & SMITH LTD.  
One SeaGate, 24th Floor  
P.O. Box 10032  
Toledo, Ohio 43699-0032  
Phone: (419) 247-1766  
Fax: (419) 247-1777  
[rjgilmer@eastmansmith.com](mailto:rjgilmer@eastmansmith.com)

/s/ Timothy J. Coleman  
Timothy J. Coleman  
Bruce McCulloch  
Terry Calvani  
John K. Warren  
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS  
DERINGER US LLP  
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington DC 20004-2692  
Phone: (202) 777-4555  
Fax: (202) 777-4555  
[tim.coleman@freshfields.com](mailto:tim.coleman@freshfields.com)

*Counsel for Vitafoam, Inc. and Vitafoam  
Products Canada Ltd.*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on August 17, 2011, a copy of the foregoing was filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system. Notice of this filing will be sent by operation of the Court's electronic filing system to all parties indicated on the electronic filing receipts. Parties may access this filing through the Court's system.

/s/ Elliot A. Silver